

**Court of Appeals, Division One**

**Special Action**

**1 CA-SA 24-0086**

**MARICOPA et al. v HON AINLEY et al.**

**Appellate Case Information**

Case Filed: 26-Apr-2024  
Case Closed: 26-Aug-2024

**Decision**

**Dept/Composition**

**Department D**

Hon. Maria Elena Cruz  
Hon. David B Gass  
Hon. Daniel J Kiley

**Side 1. MARICOPA COUNTY; BILL GATES, STEVE GALLARDO, THOMAS GALVIN, CLINT HICKMAN, JACK SELLERS, the Maricopa County Board of Supervisors; STEPHEN RICHER, the Maricopa County Recorder, Petitioner**

**(Litigant Group) MARICOPA et al.**

- Maricopa County
- Bill Gates
- Steve Gallardo
- Thomas Galvin
- Clint L Hickman
- Jack Sellers
- Stephen I Richer  
AZ Bar No. 32934  
[Current Member]

**Co-Counsel for: Petitioners**

Thomas P Liddy, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 19384)  
Joseph Eugene La Rue, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 31348)  
Jack O'Connor, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 30660)  
Rosa Aguilar, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 37774)  
Brett William Johnson, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 21527)  
Eric H Spencer, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 22707)  
Colin P Ahler, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 23879)  
Ian R Joyce, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 35806)

Court of Appeals, Division One

Special Action

1 CA-SA 24-0086

MARICOPA et al. v HON AINLEY et al.

Side 2. THE HONORABLE TINA AINLEY, Judge of the SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF ARIZONA, in and for the County of YAVAPAI,

Respondent Judge,

STRONG COMMUNITIES FOUNDATION OF ARIZONA INCORPORATES; ERIC LOVELIS; WILLIAM JOSEPH APPLETON; LAURA HARRISON; YAVAPAI COUNTY; CRAIG L. BROWN; JAMES GREGORY; DONNA G. MICHAELS; MARY MALLORY; HARRY B. OBERG; MICHELLE M. BURCHILL; COCONINO COUNTY; JERONIMO VASQUEZ; PATRICE HORSTMAN; ADAM HESS; JUDY BEGAY; LENA FOWLER; PATTY HANSON

Real Parties in Interest., Respondent

(Litigant Group) HON AINLEY

- Hon. Tina R Ainley, Respondent Judge

(Litigant Group) STRONG COMMUNITIES

- Strong Communities Foundation of Arizona Incorporates, Real Party in Interest
- Eric Lovelis, Real Party in Interest
- William Joseph Appleton, Real Party in Interest
- Laura Harrison

Co-Counsel for: Real Parties Strong et al.

Jennifer Wright, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 27145)

James K Rogers, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 27287)

(Litigant Group) YAVAPAI et al.

- Yavapai County, Real Party in Interest
- Craig Brown, Real Party in Interest
- James T Gregory, Real Party in Interest  
AZ Bar No. 21499  
[Disbarred]  
Admitted 4/22/03
- Donna G Michaels, Real Party in Interest
- Mary Mallory, Real Party in Interest
- Harry B Oberg, Real Party in Interest
- Michelle Burchill, Real Party in Interest

Attorneys for: Real Parties Yavapai County et al.

Thomas M Stoxen, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 14904)

Michael J Gordon, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 21798)

(Litigant Group) COCONINO et al.

- Coconino County, Real Party in Interest
- Jeronimo Vasquez, Real Party in Interest
- Patrice Horstman, Real Party in Interest
- Adam Hess, Real Party in Interest
- Judy Begay, Real Party in Interest
- Lena Fowler, Real Party in Interest
- Patricia Hanson, Real Party in Interest

Attorney for: Real Parties Coconino et al.

Rose Winkeler, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 25023)

(Litigant Group) AZ ALLIANCE/VOTO

- Arizona Alliance for Retired Americans, Real Party in Interest
- Voto Latino, Real Party in Interest

Co-Counsel for: Real Parties AZ Alliance/Voto

D Andrew Gaona, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 28414)

Austin C Yost, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 34602)

Lalitha D Madduri, Esq. (DC Bar No. 1659412)

Daniel Cohen, Esq. (AZ Bar No. COHEN-Elias.law)

Elena Rodriguez Armenta, Esq. (NY Bar No. 5708367)

CASE STATUS

Aug 26, 2024...Case Closed

PREDECESSOR CASE (S)	Cause/Charge/Class	Judgment/Sentence	Judge, Role <Comments>	Trial	Dispo
YAV S1300CV202400175			Tina R Ainley, Authoring Judge of Order		

Court of Appeals, Division One

Special Action

1 CA-SA 24-0086

MARICOPA et al. v HON AINLEY et al.

DESCENDENT CASE(S)

ASC CV-24-0123-PR
ASC T-24-0004-CV

CASE DECISION

30-May-2024 MEMORANDUM DECISION

Maria Cruz.....Author
David Gass.....Concur
Daniel Kiley.....Concur

Filed: 30-May-2024 Mandate:

Table with 1 row: Decision Disposition
Jurisdiction Accepted
Relief Granted

25 PROCEEDING ENTRIES

- 1. 26-Apr-2024 FILED: Petition for Special Action; Petition for Special Action Certificate of Compliance; Petition for Special Action Certificate of Service (Petitioner)
2. 26-Apr-2024 FILED: Appendix Index for Petition for Special Action; (Untitled) Appendix (Part 2); (Untitled) Appendix (Part 3); (Untitled) Appendix (Part 4) (Petitioner)
3. 26-Apr-2024 FILED: (Untitled) Appendix (Part 5) (Petitioner)
4. 29-Apr-2024 FILED: Special Action Clerk Notice (Assigned to Dept D, Judges Thumma, Campbell, Brown)
5. 29-Apr-2024 FILED: Special Action Stay Hearing Scheduling Requirements
6. 29-Apr-2024 FILED: Memorandum: Judge Cruz for Judge Thumma; Judge Gass for Judge Campbell; Judge Kiley for Judge Brown (Chief Judge Gass)
7. 29-Apr-2024 FILED: Emergency Motion To Stay Trial Court Proceedings Pending Petition For Special Action; Certificate of Service (Petitioner)
8. 30-Apr-2024 FILED: Response to Petitioners' Emergency Motion to Stay Trial Court Proceedings Pending Petition for Special Action; Certificate Of Service: Response To Petitioners' Emergency Motion To Stay Trial Court Proceedings Pending Petition For Special Action; Certificate Of Compliance: Response To Petitioners' Emergency Motion To Stay Trial Court Proceedings Pending Petition For Special Action (Real Party in Interest Stong et al.)
9. 30-Apr-2024 FILED: Notice of Stay Hearing (05/01/2024)
10. 1-May-2024 FILED: Motion to Dismiss; Certificate of Service: Motion to Dismiss; Certificate of Compliance: Motion to Dismiss (Real Party in Interest Strong et al.)
11. 1-May-2024 ORDERED: Emergency Motion To Stay Trial Court Proceedings Pending Petition For Special Action (Petitioner) = GRANTED until further order of the court. Hon Maria Elena Cruz - Author
12. 1-May-2024 (Due to a system failure, the stay hearing held 5/1/24 was not recorded) ORDERED: this notice shall be filed and made part of the record in this case. Hon Maria Elena Cruz - Author
13. 3-May-2024 FILED: Maricopa County Petitioners' Response Opposing Real Parties in Interest's Motion to Dismiss; Response Opposing Motion to Dismiss Certificate of Service (Petitioners)
14. 6-May-2024 RECEIPT No.: 2024-00448 ; \$140.00, Authorization: # 27021805205, Applied to: STRONG COMMUNITIES - Class B Filing Fee (\$140.00) Paid for: James K Rogers - By nCourt LLC
15. 7-May-2024 FILED: Real Parties In Interest-Plaintiffs' Opposition To Maricopa County's Petition For Special Action; Certificate Of Compliance: Real Parties In Interest-Plaintiffs' Opposition To Maricopa County's Petition For Special Action; Certificate Of Service: Real Parties In Interest-Plaintiffs' Opposition To Maricopa County's Petition For Special Action; Appendix For Real Parties In Interest-Plaintiffs' Opposition To Maricopa County's Petition For Special Action (Real Party in Interest Strong et al.)
16. 10-May-2024 FILED: Reply to Maricopa Defendants' Response to Real Party in Interest's Motion to Dismiss; Certificate of Service: Reply to Maricopa Defedants' [sic] Response to Real Party in Interest's Motion to Dismiss; Certificate of Compliance: Reply to Maricopa Defedants' [sic] Response to Real Party in Interest's Motion to Dismiss (Real Party in Interest et al.)
17. 14-May-2024 FILED: Reply in Support of Petition for Special Action; Reply in Support of Petition for Special Action Certificate of Service; Reply in Support of Petition for Special Action Certificate of Compliance (Petitioner)
18. 14-May-2024 FILED: ASC Order denying petition to transfer

**Court of Appeals, Division One**

**Special Action**

**1 CA-SA 24-0086**

**MARICOPA et al. v HON AINLEY et al.**

**25 PROCEEDING ENTRIES**

19. 30-May-2024 MEMORANDUM DECISION (Jurisdiction Accepted, Relief Granted) Hon Maria Elena Cruz - Author; Hon David B Gass - Concur; Hon Daniel J Kiley - Concur
20. 30-May-2024 FILED: Decision Distribution Notification
21. 14-Jun-2024 FILED: Email Notice from ASC re: Petition for Review filed 06/12/24; request for partial record
22. 14-Jun-2024 FILED: Letter forwarding partial record to Arizona Supreme Court
23. 14-Jun-2024 FILED: Amended Letter forwarding partial record to Arizona Supreme Court
24. 2-Aug-2024 FILED: Letter from ASC, 8/2/24, re: Petition for Review DENIED on 8/2/24; Request for Attorneys Fees DENIED
25. 26-Aug-2024 FILED: Letter, 8/26/24, Certified Copy of Memorandum Decision. No physical record to be returned to clerk, Maricopa County Superior Court.